

***Cratylus*: a study about language in Plato's works. Doctoral Thesis**

Cratílo: un estudio sobre el lenguaje en platón. Tesis doctoral

Juan Manuel López¹

Abstract

This paper gives an overview of what was a long doctoral thesis process. Its results, implications and consequences arising from the academic exercise carried out over more than 7 years make up the centerpiece of this text. The results contain different exercises of writing and they are the central focus of the text. In the same process the results are evident at the level of directed theses, creation and participation in academic events as well as other products. These aspects are undoubtedly constitutive of the academic philosophy's work and that, therefore, help to the

¹ Researcher, Faculty of Fine arts and Humanities, Universidad Tecnológica de Pereira, jlmr@utp.edu.co

institution (Technological University of Perira) in different ways such as the Graduate Program in Philosophy and the Master Program to establish itself as a leading program with its research group in Ancient Philosophy.

Keywords: Writing, events, projects.

Resumen

El presente texto hace un balance general de lo que fue un largo proceso de tesis doctoral. Sus resultados, implicaciones y las consecuencias que se desprenden del ejercicio académico llevado a cabo a lo largo de más de 7 años constituyen el eje central del texto. Los resultados contienen diferentes ejercicios de escritura y ellos son el punto central de este texto. En el mismo proceso se evidencian los resultados a nivel de tesis dirigidas, creación y participación en eventos académicos así como de otros productos. Estos aspectos que sin duda son constitutivos del quehacer académico de la filosofía y que, por ende, ayudan a que una institución como el programa de Licenciatura en Filosofía de la Universidad Tecnológica se afianza como un programa líder con su grupo de investigación en Filosofía Antigua.

Palabras Clave: Escritura, eventos, proyectos.

1. Introduction

The issue of this work, as the title of the project announces, was the problem of language in Plato. Plato, as is well known, is the first cornerstone of philosophy and also, therefore, of writing. While there are testimonies of some of the thinkers before Plato, such thinkers are known precisely by the work of the Greek philosopher. However, the central point of this project was necessarily its conception of dialectics, which was interpreted into a scriptural component unlike the verbal component in which the different critics of philosophy have commonly done so. This

searching exercise on the grounds of philosophy at the level of the depth of what demands a doctoral thesis in a classical way (review of different sources in different languages, knowledge of history and the Greek language) opened and enabled the creation of different products, study groups, strengthening of research groups, which are the mainstay not only of one of the undergraduate programs of the Technological University of Pereira, but also from his Master's program in philosophy. In advance, we will look at some of the results that the project yielded beyond the understanding of the topic of dialectics and writing in the Greek world, that was the one that was initially sought, and which has been concretized in some articles and, of course, in the doctoral thesis which has the name of Cratilo, a dialectical practice in and with names.

2. Materials and methods

The methodology used is hermeneutic. In this way, the working material used is always a bibliographic material, which can be found in detail in the References of the project. That's why, it was necessary to have training in different languages in order to review many texts in their original language. It can be consulted in my CvLac². The method of work can be described as follows: Gadamer's work, especially in his *Gesammelte Werke* (Complete Works) Volumes II (1985) and III (1991) shape and framework of interpretation. This work, also, takes from Havelock (1994) the strong importance of writing as a technology of thought. This same methodology is applied by the great master Emilio Lledó (1984, 1994, 1999, 2000) for the Spanish language. In this direction what has been sought is the work related to the state of current art, and this in relation to the forms of classical approach to the Hellenic world.

² https://scienti.minciencias.gov.co/cvlac/visualizador/generarCurriculoCv.do?cod_rh=0000983128 (Research's date october 9, 2020)

3. Results and discussion

As usually happens with works that start with mere hypotheses or initial assumptions, typical of the humanities labor, the following work goes beyond the objectives initially proposed. Although at one point the work had an eminently theoretical objective, it is true that in practice we were able to achieve some results that are quite good. The results are described below in the following categories: business products (1), informative texts (3), texts research results (3), directed theses (undergraduate) (7), organization of events (13), legal documents (2), participation in events (11), courses designed for master's program (5), social communication of knowledge (2).

The following outputs are described³:

<i>Name</i>	<i>Category</i>
Paideia Educational and Cultural Association	Business products - Process innovations

Publications

<i>Name</i>	<i>Informative texts</i>
Notes on translation, or the importance of polyglossy in the formation of citizens	Social communication of knowledge
Dialogue and Comedy in Plato's Works, An Approach to the Problem of the Genre	Articles published in Journals B, C or D
The relationship between men and animals	Social communication of knowledge

<i>Name</i>	<i>Books resulting from research work</i>
Cratilo, a dialectical practice in and with names	Book resulting from research work
Greek II. Third declension. Theory and exercises	Textbook
What is dialectics? an inquiry to the <i>Cratylus</i>	Research article

<i>Name</i>	<i>Undergraduate degree work</i>
Say/show, escape route to Wittgensteinian bisegmentation?	Undergraduate degree work
Cinema, a didactic tool for teaching philosophy	Undergraduate degree work
Epicurus, a critique of the Greek paideia	Undergraduate degree work
Ethics of Conscience, Ernst Tugendhat and the Debate for a Plausible Justification of Moral Judgments	Undergraduate degree work
Distance in Time for Gadamer's Hermeneutic Understanding, Applied to Warhol's Campbell's Soup Cans	Undergraduate degree work
Parquesofico as a didactic resource for teaching and learning philosophy	Undergraduate degree work
Recognition Without Ethics	Undergraduate degree work

<i>Name</i>	<i>Events organisation</i>
Balances and Challenges of the JEP (Organizer. Social appropriation of knowledge)	Scientific or technological event organisation
Conversation space for the German language (Organizer. Social appropriation of knowledge)	Scientific or technological event organisation
Practice space for the English language (Organizer. Social appropriation of knowledge)	Scientific or technological event organisation
Practice area for the Portuguese language (Organizer. Social appropriation of knowledge)	Scientific or technological event organisation
Space for the practice of the French language (Organizer. Social appropriation of knowledge)	Scientific or technological event organisation
Philosophy of Law and the Generality of Politics (Organizer. Social appropriation of knowledge)	Scientific or technological event organisation
First Conference of Advances in Research Faculty of Fine Arts and Humanities (Organizer. Social appropriation of knowledge)	Scientific or technological event organisation
III Interinstitutional Forum of Students and Professors of Philosophy (Organizer. Social appropriation of knowledge)	Scientific or technological event organisation
First Conference of Advances in Research (Organizer. Social appropriation of knowledge)	Scientific or technological event organisation
Second Conference of Advances in Research Faculty of Fine Arts and Humanities: Friendship in Aristotle (Organizer. Social appropriation of knowledge)	Scientific or technological event organisation

Second Conference of Advances in Research Faculty of Fine Arts and Humanities: Enhancing political subjectivity from an experience of education for peace (Organizer. Social appropriation of knowledge)	Scientific or technological event organisation
--	--

Second Conference of Advances in Research (Organizer. Social appropriation of knowledge)	Scientific or technological event organisation
IV Interinstitutional Forum of Students and Professors of Philosophy (Organizer. Social appropriation of knowledge)	Scientific or technological event organisation

<i>Name</i>	<i>Legal agreements</i>
Specific Agreement UNAD UTP	Pedagogical strategies for the promotion of CT and I
Framework cooperation agreement between UNAD and UTP	Pedagogical strategies for the promotion of CT and I

Participation in events

<i>Name</i>
Forum Aesthetics, Philosophy and Literature
III International Congress on Politics and Globalization
IV Regional Forum of Philosophy Students
IV Regional Forum of Philosophy Students, Universidad del Quindío - Universidad Tecnológica de Pereira. September 2015
IX Forum of Professors of Philosophy. Universidad del Quindío
IX Teachers' Forum Universidad del Quindío
Why Plato? an apology of the classical subjects in philosophy. Inaugural lesson
V Interinstitutional Forum of Students and Professors of Philosophy (Social appropriation of knowledge)
VII Forum of Professors of Philosophy. May 2015
VII Forum of Professors of Philosophy Universidad del Quindío
VIII Philosophy Teachers Forum. May 2016

Course Designed for Master's Programs

<i>Name</i>
Context Seminar I
Context Seminar II
Context Seminar III
Foundation Seminar I
Foundation Seminar III

Social Communication of Knowledge

Social Communication of Knowledge

<i>Name</i>	<i>Category</i>
2. Facebook page (CTL) of the Research group on education in Greece in partnership with UNAD (National Open and Distance University)	Social Communication of Knowledge
Facebook page (CTL) V Interinstitutional Forum of Students and Professors of Philosophy in association with the UNAD (National Open and Distance University) in it participate several professors of Philosophy and Social Sciences of the country and the region	Social Communication of Knowledge

4. Conclusions

The results of this research are numerous and important, but do not show anything decisive. From this project the important practice of writing was fostered through the research group, anchored to its seedbed. This work helped to consolidate the union between the Technological University of Pereira and the National Open and Distance University. These universities are currently working on the formulation of other projects and even on the design of a virtual national master's degree program, taking like point of depart the Master in Philosophy of the Technological University of Pereira. In addition, teamwork has been made

possible in a collaborative way around outreach and extension events that contribute to make the role of the humanities in Colombia much more visible.

References

Presentation of the bibliographic sources that supported the construction and development of the research (at least half of the references must be from recognized databases).

A.A.V.V (1987) *A companion to Plato*. Ed. Wiley-Blackwell.

A. J. Festugière (1950) *Contemplation et vie contemplative selon Platon*. Ed Librairie Philosophique.

Aristóteles (1992) *Poética*. Ed. Gredos.

Aristóteles (1998) *Metafísica*. Ed. Gredos.

Aristóteles (1982) *Categorías, Tópicos, Sobre las refutaciones sofísticas*. Ed. Gredos.

Arnauld, A. (1660). *Grammaire generale et raisonnée*. Ed. Pierre le Petit.

Bajtin, M. (1989). *Teoría y estética de la novela*. Ed. Taurus.

Barney, Rachel (2001) *Names and Nature in Plato's Cratylus*. Ed. Routledge.

Baxter, Thymothy, (1992). *The Cratylus, Plato's critique of naming*. Ed. E.J.Brill.

Berenguer, A. (1999) *Gramática Griega*. Ed Bosch.

- Bravo, F. *Estudios de filosofía antigua*. Ed. Comisión de Estudios de Postgrado. Facultad de humanidades y educación. Universidad Central de Venezuela.
- Bravo, F.(2002) *Teoría Platónica de la definición*. Ed. Fondo editorial de Humanidades y Educación.
- Bieda, E. (2018) *Griego Filosófico*. Ed. Teseo.
- Bellido Molero, A. (1996) *Sofistas testimonios y fragmentos*. Ed. Gredos.
- Brandwood L. (2010) “Stylometry and Chronology” en *The Cambridge Companion to Plato* por Richard Kraut; 79- 102).
- Brisson, L. et Pradeau, J. F. (1998) *Le vocabulaire de Platon*. Ed. Ellipses.
- Buarque, L. (2011) *As armas cômicas, os interlocutores de Platão no Cratílo*. Ed. Hexis.
- Burnet, I. (1941) *Opera Platonis*, Κρατύλος Ed, Typogrpheo Clarendoniano,
- Burnet, J. (1936) *The socratic doctrine of the soul* Ed. British Academy.
- Chapell Timothy (2004) *Reading Plato's Tehatetetetus*. Ed. Hackett.
- Cassirer, Ernst (1993) *La filosofía de la Ilustración*. Ed. F.C.E.
- Chomsky, Noam (2002) *Syntactic Structures*. Ed. Mouton de Gruyter.
- Clavo, Maite (2004) “Vencer en el diálogo, justicia y retórica en Esquilo y Platón”. *Itaca, cuadernos catalanes de cultura*, 20, 73 – 86

- Colli, G. (2005) *El nacimiento de la filosofía*. Ed. Tusquets.
- Cousin, V. (1837) *Diálogos* Tomo XI. Ed. Rey et Gravier.
- Cousin, V. (1826) *Diálogos* Tomo III. Ed. Rey et Gravier.
- Crombie I. M (1979) *Análisis de las doctrinas de Platón*. T.I. Ed. Revista de Occidente.
- Davidson, D. (2005) *Truth, Language, and History*. Ed. Oxford University Press.
- De Abdera, P. (1996) *Discursos dobles*. Ed. Akal.
- Devereux, D.T. (1978) Nature and teaching in Plato's Meno. *Revista Phronesis*, 23(2), 118-126.
- Dickens C. (2000) *Hard Times*. Ed. Wordsworth Editions.
- Dominguez A. (2002) *Cratílo o del lenguaje*. Ed. Trotta.
- Eggers Lan, C. (2000) *El sol, la línea y la caverna*. Ed. Colinhue.
- Escobar, J. (2006) “¿Como se puede llegar tarde al conocimiento de las cosas? Sobre logos y ousia en el Cratílo de Platón”. En: Estudios de Filosofía. Instituto de filosofía Universidad de Antioquia.
- Ewgen M. S. (2014) *Plato's Cratylus, The comedy of Language*. Ed. Indiana University Press.
- Exupéry, Frede Saint (1984) *Le petit prince*. Ed. Gallimard.
- Michael (1987). *Essays in ancient philosophy*. Ed. University of Minnesota Press.

- Frege, Gottlog (1973). *Estudios sobre semántica*. Ed. Ariel,
- Gadamer H.-G. (2000). *Platos dialektische Ethik*. Ed. Felix Meiner Verlag.
- Gadamer H.-G. (1995) *Hacia la prehistoria de la metafísica*. Ed. Alcion Editora. Argentina.
- Gadamer H.-G. Programa sobre historia de la filosofía griega:
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HNf8vhDTnQo> (Julio 4 del 2015)
- Gadamer H.-G. (2003) *Verdad y método* T.I Ed. Sígueme Salamanca.
- Gadamer H.-G. (2001) *Antología*. Ed. Sígueme.
- Gadamer H.-G. (1985) *Gesammelte Werke. Griechische Philosophie*. T. II . Ed. J.C.B Mohr.
- Gadamer H.-G. (1990) *Hermeneutik. Wahrheit und Methoden*. Ed. J.C.B Mohr.
- García Santos Cristina (2014) *Los escritos de Gadamer sobre Platón: un diagnóstico de Verdad y Metodo, Diálogo y dialéctica en la experiencia Hermeneutica*. Tesis doctoral UNED
- Gerald, Peach A (2010) *Plato a guide for the perplexed*. Ed. Continuum.
- Gigon Olof (1980) *Los orígenes de la filosofía griega*. Ed. Gredos.
- Gilson; Etienne (1922) *La philosophie au Moyen Âge*. Ed. Payot.

- G. Glotz (1956). *La Civilización Egea*. México. Unión Tipográfica. Editorial Hispanoamericana.
- Goldschmit, V. (1947) *Les dialogues de Platon*. Ed. Universitaires de France.
- Goldschmit, V. (1981) *Essai sur le « Cratyle »*. Ed. Librairie philosophique J. Vrin.
- Gonzales J. Francisco (1998) *Dialectic and Dialogue. Plato's practice of philosophical inquiry*. Ed. Northwestern University Press.
- Guthrie, W.K.C (2000; 50) *A history of Greek Philosophy* T.III, IV, V Ed. Cambridge University Press. London. U.K.
- Guthrie, W.K.C (1993) *Historia de la filosofía* T. II. Ed. Gredos .
- Haarmann, H. (2001). *Historia Universal de la Escritura*. Gredos.
- Heidegger Martín (2009) *La pregunta por la cosa*. Ed. Palamedes.
- Havelock, E. A. (1994) *Preface to Plato*. Harvard University Press.
- Havelock, E. A. (1934). *The evidence for the teaching of Scrates*. Harvard University Press.
- Hoffman O., Debruner A. y Scherer A (1969) *Historia de la lengua griega*. Ed. Gredos.
- Jaeger Werner (2001) *Paideia: Los ideales de la cultura griega*. Ed. F.C.E.
- Jenofonte, *Memorabilia* disponible en <http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/hopper/text?doc=Perseus:text:1999.01.0207> (consultado diciembre 17/ 2018)

Jenofonte (1993) *Recuerdos de Sócrates, Económico, Banquete, Apología de Sócrates*. Ed. Gredos.

Jowet Benjamin (1980) *Cratylus*. Ed. Dodo Press.

Kahn H Charles (2010) *Platón y el diálogo socrático*. Ed. Escolar y mayo.

Kuhn, Thomas (1994) *¿Qué son las revoluciones científicas?*. Ed. Altaya,
Laertiud Diogenes (1980) *ΒΙΩΝ ΚΑΙ ΓΝΩΜΩΝ ΤΩΝ ΕΝ ΦΙΛΟΣΟΦΙΑΙ ΕΥΔΟΚΙΜΗΣΑΝΤΩΝ*. Ed. Harvard University.

Lee, Franklin (2001) "The Structure of Dialectic in the Meno" *Phronesis* 46 (4):413 - 439 Lenormant Charles (1861) *Commentaire sur le Cratyle de Platón* ed. Athènes. Place du Palais.

Liddell George Henry and Soctt Robert (1996) *Grek- English Lexicon*. Ed. Harper and Brothers Franklin Square.

Lledó Iñigo, E. (1984) *La memoria del logos*. Estudios sobre el diálogo platónico. Ed. Taurus.

Lledó Iñigo, E. (2000) *El surco del tiempo. Meditaciones sobre el mito platónico de la escritura y la memoria* Ed. Crítica.

Lledó Iñigo, E. (1998) *El silencio de la escritura*. Ed. Espasa Calpe.

Marisco, Claudia (2011) *Zonas de tensión dialógica*. Ed. Libros del Zorzal

Mockus Antanas (1983) *Tecnología educativa y Taylorización de la educación*. Universidad Nacional.

- Naddaf, G. (2005). *The greek concept of nature*. United States of America. : Ed. State University of New York Press.
- Navarre Octave (1900) *Essay sur la réthorique grecque avant Aristote*. Ed. Librairie achette et C.
- Navarro, B. (1964). *Manual de traducción griega*. México: Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México.
- Nietzsche, F. (1907). *Die Geburt der Tragödie*. Leipzig: C.G Nauman Verlag.
- Nussbaum, M. (1995) *Justicia poética*. Ed. Andrès Bello.
- Nussbaum, M. (1999) *The fragility of goodnes*. Ed. Cambridge University. United States of America
- Pelaez, C. P. (2019). *La amistad en Aristóteles un fundamento para los juicios éticos*. Ed. Universidad Tecnológica de Pereira.
- Platón (1987) Obras T.II. *Gorgias, Menéxeno, Eutidemo, Menón, Cratílo*. Ed. Gredos.
- Popper Karl (1945) *The open society and its enemies*. Ed. George Routledhe.
- Pottier Navarro, Huguette (1991): *la polisemia léxica en español, teoría y resolución*. Versión española de: Segundo Álvarez Pérez - Bilblioteca románica hispánica. Ed. Gredos.
- Proclus (2007) *On Cratylus*. Ed. Cornell University Press. Ithaca.
- Proclus (1999) *Lecturas del Cratílo de Platón*. Ed. Akal Clásica.

- Rapp, Christof, "Aristotle's Rhetoric", The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Spring 2010 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.) <http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2010/entries/aristotle-rhetoric/>
- Robinson, R. (1953). *Plato's earlier dialectic*. Ed. Oxford.
- Rode, Erwin (1903). *Psique. Seelencult und Unsterblichkeitsglaube der Griechen*. Ed. J.C.B Mohr.
- Rodriguez, A. F. (1992). *Nueva sintaxis del griego antiguo*. Ed. Gredos. Madrid.
- Rorty, R. (1990). *El giro lingüístico*. Ed Paidos.
- Ross David (1966) *Plato's theory of ideas*. Ed. Oxford University.
- Rousseau, J.J. (2019). *L'Emile*. Disponible en : http://www.ac-grenoble.fr/PhiloSophie/old2/file/rousseau_emile.pdf
- Sádava, Javier (1989) *La filosofía moral analítica de Wittgstein a Tugendhat*. Ed. Mondadori.
- Samaranch. F. de P (1960) *Platón Obras completas*. Ed. Aguilar.
- Saussure, F. de (1.967) *Cours de linguistique générale*. Grande Biblioteque Payot,
- Sedley, D. (Fall 2013 Edition). "Plato's Cratylus". The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. <http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2013/entries/plato-cratylus>
- Schäfer, C. (2007). *Platon-Lexikon*. Germany: Darmstadt : Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft (WBG).

Schleiermacher Friedrich (1974) *Phaidon, Das Gastmahl, Kratylus*. Germany.

Sedley, David (2002) *Plato's Cratylus*. Ed. Cambridge University Press.

Silverman, Allan, "Plato's Middle Period Metaphysics and Epistemology", The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Fall 2014 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), Disponible en: <<http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2014/entries/plato-metaphysics/>>.

Tuiner, Steven S (1970) "On the "kingship" of "all nature" in Plato's Meno". Publicado en Revista Phronesis, vol. 15 no. 1 pp. 1-4.

Tugendhat, E. (1982) *Traditional & analytical philosophy*. Lectures on philosophy of language. Ed. Cambridge University.

Tugendhat, E. (2003) *Introducción a la filosofía analítica*. Ed. Gedisa.

Tugendhat, E. (1976) *Vorlesungen zur Einführung in die sprachanalytische Philosophie*. Ed. Suhrkamp.

Tugendhat, E. (2010). *Logisch-semantische Propädeutik*. Ed. Reclam. Germany.

Tugendhat, E. (1997). *Propedeutica lógico-semática*. Ed. Anthropos. Madrid.

Vives, L. (1949). *Lengua Griega*. Zaragoza: Luis Vives.

Wieland, Wolfgang. (1991). *La crítica de Platón a la escritura y los límites de la comunicabilidad*. En Methexis. Vol VI. Pp. 19-37.

Zaranka, J. (1983). *Cratílo*. Ed. Universidad Nacional